

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE**

IN RE: ARMODAFINIL PATENT LITIGATION)	MDL Docket No.: 1:10-md-2200-GMS
CEPHALON, INC. and CEPHALON FRANCE, Plaintiffs,)	
v.)	Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-7-GMS
WATSON LABORATORIES, INC., Defendant.)	
CEPHALON INC. and CEPHALON FRANCE, Plaintiffs,)	
v.)	Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-55-GMS
SANDOZ INC., Defendant.)	Civil Action No. 1:11-cv-782-GMS
CEPHALON INC. and CEPHALON FRANCE, Plaintiffs,)	
v.)	Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-210-GMS
LUPIN LIMITED, Defendant.)	
CEPHALON INC. and CEPHALON FRANCE, Plaintiffs,)	
v.)	Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-695-GMS
APOTEX INC., Defendants.)	Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-1078-GMS

**DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' RULE 52(c) MOTION FOR
JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW**

Defendants Watson Laboratories, Inc., Sandoz Inc., Lupin Limited and Apotex Inc. ("Defendants") hereby submit this response to Cephalon's motion for judgment as a matter of law. (D.I. 300.) Defendants oppose the motion. However, pursuant to the Court's July 24, 2012 instruction, Defendants do not provide the full basis for their opposition in this paper, but will

fully respond to the merits of Cephalon's motion for judgment as a matter of law in post-trial briefing.

Dated: July 31, 2012

Respectfully submitted,

PHILLIPS, GOLDMAN & SPENCE, P.A.

Of Counsel:

/s/ John C. Phillips, Jr.
John C. Phillips, Jr. (#110)
Megan C. Haney (#5016)
1200 North Broom Street
Wilmington, Delaware 19806
(302) 655-4200
jcp@pgslaw.com
mch@pgslaw.com

Michael K. Nutter
Kevin E. Warner
David Luger
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP
35 West Wacker Drive
Chicago, Illinois 60601
mnutter@winston.com
kwarner@winston.com
dluger@winston.com

*Attorneys for Defendant
Watson Laboratories, Inc.*

PROCTOR HEYMAN LLP

Of Counsel:

/s/ Neal C. Belgam
Neal C. Belgam (#2721)
300 Delaware Avenue, Suite 200
Wilmington, Delaware 19801
(302) 472-7300
nbelgam@proctorheyman.com

Jeffrey R. Gargano
Peter M. Siavelis
Wan-Shon Lo
Rita J. Yoon
MCDERMOTT WILL & EMERY LLP
227 West Monroe Street, Suite 4400
Chicago, Illinois 60606
jgargano@mwe.com
psiavelis@mwe.com
slo@mwe.com
ryoon@mwe.com

*Attorneys for Defendant
Sandoz Inc.*

BAYARD, P.A.

/s/ Stephen B. Brauerman

Richard D. Kirk (#922)
Stephen B. Brauerman (#4952)
222 Delaware Avenue, Suite 900
P.O. Box 25130
Wilmington, Delaware 19899
rkirk@bayardlaw.com
sbrauerman@bayardlaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendant
Lupin Limited*

Of Counsel:

Barry S. White
Steven M. Amundson
Vicki Franks
FROMMER LAWRENCE & HAUG LLP
745 Fifth Avenue
New York, New York 10151
bwhite@flhlaw.com
samundson@flhlaw.com
vfranks@flhlaw.com

FLASTER/GREENBERG P.C.

/s/ Nella M. Bloom

William J. Burnett (#4078)
Nella M. Bloom (#5430)
913 North Market Street, Suite 900
Wilmington, Delaware 19801
(302) 351-1910
william.burnett@flastergreenberg.com
nella.bloom@flastergreenberg.com

*Attorneys for Defendant
Apotex Inc.*

Of Counsel:

Robert B. Breisblatt
Craig M. Kuchii
Martin S. Masar, III
KATTEN MUCHIN ROSENMAN LLP
525 West Monroe Street
Chicago, Illinois 60661
robert.breisblatt@kattenlaw.com
craig.kuchii@kattenlaw.com
martin.masar@kattenlaw.com

Jeffrey A. Cohen
FLASTER/GREENBERG P.C.
Commerce Center
1810 Chapel Avenue West
Cherry Hill, New Jersey 08002-4609
jeffrey.cohen@flastergreenberg.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 31th day of July, 2012, I served a true and correct copy of
**DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' RULE 52(c) MOTION FOR
JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW** on the counsel of record for Plaintiffs listed below in
the manner indicated:

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

CONNOLLY, BOVE, LODGE & HUTZ LLP

Mary W. Bourke (#2356)
Dana K. Severance (#4869)
The Nemours Building
1007 North Orange Street
P.O. Box 2207
Wilmington, Delaware 19899
(302) 658-9141
mbourke@cblh.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs
Cephalon Inc. and Cephalon France*

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

Of Counsel:

Charles E. Lipsey
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,
GARRETT & DUNNER, L.L.P.
Two Freedom Square
11955 Freedom Drive
Reston, Virginia 20190
(571) 203-2700
charlie.lipsey@finnegan.com

Barbara R. Rudolph
Mark J. Feldstein
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,
GARRETT & DUNNER, L.L.P.
901 New York Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20001
(202) 408-4000
barbara.rudolph@finnegan.com
mark.feldstein@finnegan.com

Robert C. Stanley
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,
GARRETT & DUNNER, L.L.P.
3500 SunTrust Plaza
303 Peachtree Street, N.E.
Atlanta, Georgia 30308
(404) 653-6400
robert.stanley@finnegan.com

John C. Englander
Daryl L. Wiesen
GOODWIN PROCTER LLP
Exchange Place
53 State Street

Boston, Massachusetts 02109
(617) 570-1000
jenglander@goodwinprocter.com
dwiesen@goodwinprocter.com

/s/Nella M. Bloom
Nella M. Bloom, Esquire (I.D. #5430)